

English Language Arts 30–1

Examples of the Standards for Students' Writing

From the [January 2020](#) Diploma Examination

This document was written primarily for:

Students	✓
Teachers	✓
Administrators	✓
Parents	✓
General Public	✓
Others	

Copyright 2021, the Crown in Right of Alberta, as represented by the Minister of Education, Alberta Education, Provincial Assessment Sector, 44 Capital Boulevard, 10044 108 Street NW, Edmonton, Alberta T5J 5E6, and its licensors. All rights reserved.

Special permission is granted to **Alberta educators only** to reproduce, for educational purposes and on a non-profit basis, parts of this document that do **not** contain excerpted material.

Excerpted material in this document **shall not** be reproduced without the written permission of the original publisher (see credits, where applicable).

Contents

Acknowledgements.....	ii
Introduction	1
English Language Arts 30–1	
January 2020 Writing Assignments	3
Assignment I: Personal Response to Texts	4
Assignment II: Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts	9
English Language Arts 30–1	
Part A: Written Response Standards Confirmation.....	11
Examples of Students’ Writing with Teachers’ Commentaries	12
English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020 Personal Response to Texts Assignment	12
English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020 Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment	42
Scoring Categories and Criteria	77

Acknowledgements

Publication of this document would not have been possible without the permission of the students whose writing is presented. The cooperation of these students has allowed us to continue illustrating the standards of writing performance expected in the context of diploma examinations and demonstrate the variety of approaches taken by students in their writing.

This document includes the valuable contributions of many educators. Sincere thanks and appreciation are extended to the following standards confirmers: **Leta Layton, Cherry Bessey, Emily Wong, Erin Ochoa, David Wasmuth, Jim Forrest, John Finnie, Shalini Kapoor, Stephen Womack, and James Alato.**

We gratefully acknowledge the contributions made by members of the Humanities Unit and the Document Design and Desktop Publishing Unit of the Provincial Assessment Sector, Alberta Education.

You can reach us with your comments and questions by email to Gary.Hoogers@gov.ab.ca, Vera.Franjic@gov.ab.ca, or Deanna.Shostak@gov.ab.ca, or by regular mail at

Alberta Education
Box 43
44 Capital Boulevard
10044 108 Street NW
Edmonton, Alberta T5J 5E6

We would be pleased to hear from you.

Introduction

The written responses in this document are examples of *English Language Arts 30–1 Diploma Examination* student writing that received scores of Satisfactory (S), Proficient (Pf), or Excellent (E). These sample responses are taken from the January 2020 administration. Along with the commentaries that accompany them, they should help teachers and students to understand the standards for *English Language Arts 30–1 Diploma Examination* writing in relation to the scoring criteria.

The purpose of the sample responses is to illustrate the standards that governed the January 2020 marking session. The sample papers and the commentaries were used to train markers to apply the scoring criteria consistently and to justify their decisions about scores in terms of each student’s work and the criteria.

The sample responses included in this document represent a very small sample of successful approaches to the assignments.

Selection and Use of Sample Papers

The teachers on the Standards Confirmation Committee for the January 2020 marking session selected the examples of student responses included here. They also wrote the commentaries that discuss the students’ writing in terms of the scoring criteria used for marking.

During their preparation for the January 2020 marking session, markers reviewed and validated the standards represented by these sample responses. Markers then used these sample responses as guidelines for marking the written-response sections of the *January 2020 English Language Arts 30–1 Diploma Examination*.

Cautions

1. The commentaries are brief.

The commentaries were written for groups of markers to discuss and apply during the marking session. Although brief, they provide a model for relating specific examples from student work to the details in a specific scoring criterion.

2. Neither the scoring guide nor the assignments are meant to limit students to a single organizational or rhetorical approach in completing any diploma examination assignment.

Students are free to select and organize their materials in a manner that they feel will enable them to present their ideas most successfully. In fact, part of what is being assessed is the final effectiveness of the content, the form and structure, and the rhetorical choices that students make.

The student writing in this document illustrates *just a few* of the many organizational and rhetorical strategies used in January 2020.

There is *no preferred approach* to an assignment except the approach that accomplishes the student's goal of effectively communicating their own ideas about the topic.

We advise you not to draw any conclusions about common patterns of approach taken by students.

3. The sample papers presented in this document must not be used as models for instructional purposes.

Because these papers are illustrations only, and because they are sample responses to a set topic, students must be cautioned not to memorize the content of any of these assignments or to use them when completing classroom assignments or when writing future diploma examinations.

The *approaches* taken by students at the standard of excellence, not their words or ideas, are what students being examined in the future should consider emulating. In fact, it is hoped that the variety of approaches presented here will inspire students to experiment with diction, syntax, form, and structure as a way of developing an engaging and thoughtful individual voice.

Examination markers and staff at Alberta Education take any possibility of plagiarism or cheating seriously. The consequences for students are grave.

4. It is essential that you consider each of these examples of student writing in light of the constraints of the examination situation.

Under examination conditions, students produce *first-draft writing*.

5. More information about student performance on the Part A: Written Response can be found in the [English Language Arts 30–1 Information Bulletin](#).

English Language Arts 30–1 January 2020 Writing Assignments

January 2020

English Language Arts 30–1

Part A: Written Response

Grade 12 Diploma Examination

Description

Time: 3 hours. This examination was developed to be completed in 3 hours; however, you may take up to 6 hours to complete the examination, should you need it.

Part A: Written Response consists of two assignments worth 50% of the total English Language Arts 30–1 diploma examination mark.

Assignment I:

Personal Response to Texts

Value 20% of total examination mark

Assignment II:

Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts

Value 30% of total examination mark

Recommendation: Plan your time carefully. Use the initial planning pages. Time spent in planning will result in better writing.

- You may use the following print references:
 - an English and/or bilingual dictionary
 - a thesaurus
 - an authorized writing handbook
- Space is provided in this booklet for planning.

Do not write your name anywhere in this booklet or on your response. Feel free to make handwritten revisions directly on your final response.

Instructions

- Complete Assignment I first. The Personal Response to Texts Assignment is designed to allow you time to think and reflect upon the ideas that you may also explore in Assignment II: Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts. The two assignments are thematically linked, but are not identical. Complete **both** assignments.
- It is your responsibility to print out (or handwrite) and staple all of your final written work to the designated pages in this booklet. You must also verify that this has been done correctly. Page 9 illustrates how to attach your final work to the booklet.

Additional Instructions for Students Using Word Processors

- Format your work using an easy-to-read 12-point font, double space, and use headers and footers as illustrated on page 9.

Additional Instructions for Students Who are Handwriting

- **Use the paper provided by your school for handwritten work.** Note that there is no paper provided in this booklet for final written work.
- Use blue or black ink for handwritten work.

ASSIGNMENT I: PERSONAL RESPONSE TO TEXTS

Suggested time: approximately 45 to 60 minutes

Suggested word count range: 600 to 1200 words

Carefully read and consider the texts on pages 1 to 4, and then complete the assignment that follows.

WHO BURNS FOR THE PERFECTION OF PAPER

At sixteen, I worked after high school hours
at a printing plant
that manufactured legal pads:
Yellow paper
stacked seven feet high
and leaning
as I slipped cardboard
between the pages,
then brushed red glue
up and down the stack.
No gloves: fingertips required
for the perfection of paper,
smoothing the exact rectangle.
Sluggish by 9 PM, the hands
would slide along suddenly sharp paper,
and gather slits thinner than the crevices
of the skin, hidden.
The glue would sting,
hands oozing
till both palms burned
at the punchclock.

Ten years later, in law school,
I knew that every legal pad
was glued with the sting of hidden cuts,
that every open law book
was a pair of hands
upturned and burning.

Martín Espada

“Who Burns for the Perfection of Paper,” from CITY OF COUGHING AND DEAD RADIATORS by Martín Espada. Copyright © 1993 by Martín Espada. Used by permission of W. W. Norton & Company, Inc. This selection may not be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means without the prior written permission of the publisher.

In the following excerpt from a novel, Miranda is an artist whose current project is a science-fiction graphic novel entitled Station Eleven.

from STATION ELEVEN

This excerpt is unavailable for electronic posting.

This photograph is unavailable for electronic posting.

Gudzowaty, Tomasz. From the series "Power Punch Girls", 2006.

ASSIGNMENT I: PERSONAL RESPONSE TO TEXTS

Suggested time: approximately 45 to 60 minutes

Suggested word count range: 600 to 1200 words

You have been provided with three texts on pages 1 to 4. The speaker in Martín Espada's poem "Who Burns for the Perfection of Paper" reflects on the production of legal pads. In the excerpt from Emily St. John Mandel's novel *Station Eleven*, Miranda considers her work and her relationships with others. Tomasz Gudzowaty's untitled photograph is of a woman in a training centre in Kollam, India.

The Assignment

What do these texts suggest to you about the tension between an individual's doubts and convictions? Support your idea(s) with reference to one or more of the prompting texts presented and to your previous knowledge and/or experience.

In your writing, you must

- use a prose form
- connect one or more of the prompting texts provided in this examination to the topic and to your own ideas and impressions

Fold and tear along perforation.

Assignment I: Personal Response to Texts

Initial Planning

To which of the provided texts are you responding? What is the connection between the text(s) and your response?

What idea about the prompting text(s) do you intend to explore and how does it address the topic?

State your choice of prose form. Choose from prose forms that you have practised in English Language Arts 30–1. You may respond using a personal, creative, or analytical perspective. Do NOT use a poetic form.

Use additional paper for planning if required.

**ASSIGNMENT II:
CRITICAL/ANALYTICAL RESPONSE TO LITERARY TEXTS**
Suggested time: approximately 1½ to 2 hours
Suggested word count range: 800 to 1600 words

Do *not* use the texts provided in this booklet for the Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment. Choose from short stories, novels, plays, screenplays, poetry, films, or other literary texts that you have studied in English Language Arts 30–1. When considering the works that you have studied, choose a literary text (or texts) that is meaningful to you and relevant to the following assignment.

The Assignment

Discuss the idea(s) developed by the text creator in your chosen text about the strength of an individual’s convictions when dealing with the expectations of others.

In your planning and writing, consider the following instructions.

- Carefully consider your *controlling idea* and how you will create a strong *unifying effect* in your response.
- As you develop your ideas, support them with appropriate, relevant, and meaningful examples from your choice of literary text(s).

Fold and tear along perforation.

Assignment II: Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts

Initial Planning

You may use this space for your initial planning. This information assists markers in identifying the text you have chosen to support your ideas. The markers who read your composition will be very familiar with the literary text you have chosen.

Literary Text and
Text Creator

Note: Write the title of your chosen literary text on the back cover of this examination booklet.

Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text **Suggested time: 10 to 15 minutes**

Briefly explore your reasons for selecting the literary text as support for your response. Markers will consider the information you provide here when considering the effectiveness of your supporting evidence.

English Language Arts 30–1

Part A: Written Response Standards Confirmation

Background

For all diploma examination scoring sessions, Provincial Assessment Sector staff use a process of standards confirmation to establish and illustrate expectations for students' work in relation to the scoring criteria and to ensure scoring consistency within and between marking sessions. Because there are several diploma examination administrations and scoring sessions each school year, the standards must remain consistent for each scoring session in the school year and, similarly, from year to year.

Standards for student achievement start with both the demands of the [English Language Arts Program of Studies](#) for senior high school English Language Arts and the interpretation of those demands through learning resources and classroom instruction. These agreed-upon standards are also exemplified in the kinds of tasks and the degree of independence expected of students. All these complex applications of standards precede the design, development, and scoring of each diploma examination.

The Standards Confirmation Committee is comprised of experienced teachers from representative regions of the province. These teachers work with the Provincial Assessment Sector staff responsible for the development, scoring, and results reporting for each diploma examination. Teacher-members participate over a two-year period and are required to serve as group leaders or markers during at least one of the subsequent marking sessions.

There are two essential parts to applying standards at the point of examination scoring: the expectations embedded in the scoring criteria, and the examples of students' work that illustrate the scoring criteria within each scoring category. The scoring categories and scoring criteria are available to teachers and students via the [English Language Arts 30–1 Information Bulletin](#). During each of the January and June marking sessions, example papers selected by members of the Standards Confirmation Committee are used to train markers. Subsequent to each January marking session, the example papers that received scores of Satisfactory (S), Proficient (Pf), and Excellent (E) are posted on the [Alberta Education](#) website in the documents entitled [Examples of the Standards for Students' Writing](#).

During the standards confirmation process, the

- appropriateness of the standards set by the examination in relation to students' work is confirmed
- student responses that clearly illustrate the standards in the scoring categories and the scoring criteria are selected and are used when training markers
- rationales that explain and support the selection of sample papers in terms of the scoring categories, scoring criteria, and students' work are written

Examples of Students' Writing with Teachers' Commentaries

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

Example Scored Satisfactory–1 (S)

This excerpt is unavailable for electronic posting.

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

Example Scored Satisfactory–2 (S)

This excerpt is unavailable for electronic posting.

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient–1 (Pf)

Initial Planning

To which of the provided texts are you responding? What is the connection between the text(s) and your response?

I will be writing about "Station Eleven". The text speaks to a person, Miranda, who is living in a world where she doesn't feel she belongs. Her dreams and goals and way of being is constantly being ridiculed by others which causes her to doubt herself and be insecure. There is a strain between what she thinks is right and the doubts that others have about her.

What idea about the prompting text(s) do you intend to explore and how does it address the topic?

Miranda's uncertainty about her own abilities and worthiness causes strain in her relationships, which in the end results in her losing confidence in her own beliefs and views on the world and her conforming to the opinions of others. It addresses topic by showing how her doubts about her beliefs cause tension in her relationships with her husband and herself.

State your choice of prose form. Choose from prose forms that you have practised in English Language Arts 30–1. You may respond using a personal, creative, or analytical perspective. Do NOT use a poetic form.

Critical analytical Response

English Language Arts 30-1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient-1 (Pf)

Planning

BP2: Throughout story, Miranda is bothered by ideals and expectations of her new environment. But instead of doing anything to show her _____, she instead conforms to _____'s ideas. Their anniversary dinner is spent with other people and is also focused on Arthur's accomplishments, not their relationships.

↳ Makes Miranda feel uneasy, but she lets it happen anyway

↳ She does not say anything due to the fact that she does not want to upset Arthur

↳ leaves a strain on her relationship and causes her to lose confidence in her own self-worth because she can't seem to fit in

BP1: The ideas and beliefs of others at the party greatly impact Miranda's worldview, and it causes her to judge herself based on their expectations.

↳ Tesch stands out to Miranda because she openly judges others lives. The things tesch says begins to make Miranda question her own life

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient–1 (Pf)

The ideas and beliefs that an individual has on the world shapes how they view themselves and how they judge themselves, but when they are put into unfamiliar environments that force them to doubt their views, how is their self-image and sureness in their beliefs impacted? In the excerpt from Emily St. John Mandel's novel *Station Eleven*, Miranda, an artist working on a science fiction graphic novel, is married to Arthur. Miranda and Arthur are holding a dinner with Arthur's close friends in order to celebrate his new movie and their third anniversary. The people present at the party cause Miranda to feel out of place and insignificant, and she must question not only the relationships she has, but also her own self-worth in this new environment. The excerpt demonstrates that Miranda's uncertainty about her own abilities and worthiness causes strains in her relationships, which in the end, results in her losing confidence in her own beliefs and views on the world and her conforming to the ideas of others.

The ideas and beliefs of Arthur's friends at the party greatly influences Miranda's worldview. It causes her to judge herself based on their expectations and in the end, makes her question whether being true to herself is the right thing to do. Although Miranda stays quiet during the dinner, she listens intently to what one woman, Tesch, has to say. Tesch is a woman who works in the film industry and who openly judges others based on her ideals. For example, when Tesch learns that Clark is an organizational psychologist, she calls his work "conventional" and immediately dismisses his career because he is not involved in the film industry. When she goes on to ask Miranda how her work is going, she responds by saying it is going well, but Miranda begins to think of her self through the eyes of people like Tesch. She begins describing her self as

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient–1 (Pf)

"eccentric" and just "the actor's wife". She focuses on the fact that she has no friends and that others view her as being awkward. This shows that her self-image is changing because the beliefs of others have caused her to think that what she does and what she is like is not adequate. When she is questioned on whether or not she will publish her work, Miranda explains to them that it is the work that is important to her, not whether or not she will publish her work. Although she knows this statement is true to her beliefs, Miranda still questions whether it is valid or whether it is too much of a pretentious thing to admit to others. This questioning of her own truth shows her loss of confidence in herself and her abilities and it puts strain on her relationship with herself. The opinions that others judge Miranda by not only cause her to lose confidence in herself, but also cause her to conform to their ideas.

Throughout the story, Miranda is bothered by the ideas and expectations that the people in her new environment hold, but instead of speaking up against it, she instead conforms to their ideas and it creates tension in her relationship with Arthur. For example, their anniversary dinner is spent with other people and is focused more on Arthur's accomplishments rather than their accomplishments as a couple. This situation gives Miranda an uneasy feeling and she asks herself why a moment like this would "involve anyone other than the two people who are actually married to one another". This demonstrates how she feels about the social aspect of her new environment, and how she disagrees with the fact that Arthur thinks that spending their anniversary at a party that celebrates both their marriage and his new movie is a good idea. Although this bothers her, Miranda does not say anything because, in the past, Arthur has told her to try harder to fit into her new lifestyle which she has tried doing, but it only leaves her feeling as if

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient–1 (Pf)

"she is marooned on a strange planet". When she says this, it demonstrates how she feels that she can never be a part of the famous lifestyle that the people who surround her belong to. Due to the tension that Miranda feels and her inability to speak up for what she believes in, she is unable to talk to Arthur. She notices him never looking at her and only talking to those around her, which causes her to feel as if she is failing him in some way. This feeling negatively affects their relationship, and causes her to feel insecure about her own beliefs. Her action of conforming to the ideas of those around her causes her to lose confidence in herself and lose sight of what is true to her.

In conclusion, when individuals are put in situations where their beliefs are questioned by the opinions of others, they can begin to doubt their own self-worth and lose sight of what they believe in. For Miranda, being surrounded by people in the film industry caused her to view herself in a negative light, and doubt her own abilities as an artist. In order to gain a small sense of belonging in her new environment, she conforms to the ideas of others, even when it creates a sense of unease. Not only does it put a strain on her relationship with her husband, Arthur, but it also creates a lack of confidence within herself.

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT–1

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Ideas and Impressions (Pf)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The student’s exploration of the topic is purposeful. • Perceptions and/or ideas are thoughtful and considered. • Support is specific and strengthens the student’s ideas and impressions. <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold;">Pf</p>	<p>On the <i>Initial Planning</i> page, the student introduces a purposeful exploration of the topic with the thoughtful idea that “Miranda’s uncertainty about her own abilities and worthiness causes strain in her relationships, which in the end results in her losing confidence in her own beliefs and views on the world and her conforming to the opinions of others” (1). The student develops this assertion by noting that the party guests “cause Miranda to feel out of place and insignificant” (3), making her “judge herself based on their expectations” (3). This leads to the considered idea that Miranda feels “as if she is failing him in some way” (5), is “insecure about her own beliefs” (5), and has lost “sight of what is true to her” (5), revealing a thoughtful understanding of the tension between doubt and conviction.</p> <p>The student’s perceptions of Miranda’s internal conflict are considered, as in “Although she knows this statement is true to her beliefs, Miranda still questions whether it is valid or whether it is too much of a pretentious thing to admit to others” (4) and “she feels that she can never be a part of the famous lifestyle that the people who surround her belong to” (5).</p> <p>That “Miranda begins to think of her self through the eyes of people like Tesch” (3) is strengthened by specific support, as in “She begins describing her self as ‘eccentric’ and just ‘the actor’s wife’. She focuses on the fact that she has no friends and that others view her as being awkward” (3–4). The student’s statement that Miranda’s willingness to spend their anniversary “focused more on Arthur’s accomplishments rather than their accomplishments as a couple” (4) strengthens the idea that Miranda’s inaction stems from the tension between her doubts and convictions. This idea is further strengthened by the fact that “This situation gives Miranda an uneasy feeling” (4), yet she still “does not say anything because, in the past, Arthur has told her to try harder to fit into her new lifestyle” (4).</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT–1

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Pf</p> <p>Presentation (Pf)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The voice created by the student is distinct. • Stylistic choices are specific and the student’s creation of tone is competent. • The unifying and/or aesthetic effect is capably developed. 	<p>On the <i>Planning</i> page, the student’s proposed body paragraph structure initiates a unifying effect that is developed capably through providing a basis for Miranda’s decision to conform to the “expectations of her new environment” (2), and by explaining how “The ideas and beliefs of others at the party greatly impact Miranda’s worldview, and it causes her to judge herself based on their expectations” (2). The response opens with a question that capably develops this trajectory: “The ideas and beliefs that an individual has on the world shapes how they view themselves and how they judge themselves, but when they are put into unfamiliar environments that force them to doubt their views, how is their self-image and sureness in their beliefs impacted?” (3).</p> <p>The student complements this analytical form with a distinct formal voice throughout the response, as in “she must question not only the relationships she has, but also her own self-worth in this new environment” (3) and “This feeling negatively affects their relationship, and causes her to feel insecure about her own beliefs” (5).</p> <p>Specific stylistic choices are represented through diction such as “immediately dismisses” (3), “valid” (4), and “negative light” (5), and through syntax, such as “their anniversary dinner is spent with other people and is focused more on Arthur’s accomplishments rather than their accomplishments as a couple” (4), contributing to the creation of a competent tone. By concluding with the understanding that “In order to gain a small sense of belonging in her new environment, she conforms to the ideas of others, even when it creates a sense of unease” (5), the student creates a capable unifying and aesthetic effect.</p>

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient–2 (Pf)

Initial Planning

To which of the provided texts are you responding? What is the connection between the text(s) and your response?

Image. I will be connecting and writing about how your convictions can leave you trapped.

What idea about the prompting text(s) do you intend to explore and how does it address the topic?

How your ambitions can lead to doubt which will make you feel trapped within walls

State your choice of prose form. Choose from prose forms that you have practised in English Language Arts 30–1. You may respond using a personal, creative, or analytical perspective. Do NOT use a poetic form.

Short Story

English Language Arts 30-1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient-2 (Pf)

Planning

Beginning- Woman loves to box, her dreams are to become someone her family can rely on and be protected by.

Middle- The overwhelming pressure of being number one has left her doubtful and isolated. Gaining a fear for the ring as she keeps having dreams.

End- She tries to overcome her fear in a fight and steps into the ring once again. She loses the match but she has won the mental battle.

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient–2 (Pf)

Lose Yourself

The final bell rang, through blurry sight the referee began counting, this was the last thing Pia saw as her vision began to darken. The roar of the crowd still audible as the final screeches subsided in her ears. She was on the blood soaked ground as she is finally knocked out cold.

The moon was waxing one frigid summer night, as Pia was once again training diligently for the local boxing championships held in her quaint hometown in Kollam, India. Born from a farmer and a seamstress her family had little to their names, except a little store her mother ran. Pia always loved the thrill of the fight, as being the youngest in a family of five, she had to fend for herself from the onslaught of sibling torment. Her family, however, was in crippling poverty, and with that many mouths to feed it was vexing to get enough to eat. It was bad enough that her father could no longer work due to his age and cancer consuming what was left of his life. So as she grew and grew to a towering height so did her competitive spirit.

She started off in underground street fights so that she could provide money for her family. The rigorous and testosterone filled atmosphere never fazed her as she stomped every single one of her opponents like they were ants on the burning Indian pavement. It was here on one of these nights that Pia met her friend and trainer Hasim. Hasim was a short, middle-aged man who found a light within Pia. He saw through his poor vision, her potential of becoming one of the greatest fighters in India. She a baby bird waiting to flight, and he was the one who was going to give her that push. Meeting

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient–2 (Pf)

Hasim would later become Pia greatest regret while also becoming one of her greatest achievements. Pia training had become more grueling, but more and more her reputation grew, as everyone had known her name. She had garnered this attention due to the fact that her career as a boxer had taken off and she had beaten numerous opponents that step foot in her ring. She could finally be useful to her family by providing them with enough food to eat, and for her father whose time was running out. With her winning streak you would believe she would grow arrogant, but the overwhelming pressures of being number one ate up at her.

It was not until the fifth of August that this pressure inside of her started to mess with her mind. Pia was scheduled to fight against one of the leading boxers in India, Salma Hada. This stress she felt inside of her swelled like a balloon as she did not want to disappoint her family and fans. She trained for days, never sleeping, she punched until her bones were broken and her knuckles bled. Hasim worried about her deterioration, demanded that she get some rest, and with some hostility, Pia obliged, as she always trusted his judgement.

As Pia slept in her cool rugged bed the thoughts of the fight kept her up. Twisting and turning until she finally surrendered to sleep. That night she dreamt that she was in the boxing ring alone, darkness surrounding her with no light to be seen, she felt a sensation of isolation as she was trapped within the confines of this ring with no escape from it. As she tried to leave the ring it always brought her back, it was never ending like a ring there was nowhere for her to go. She finally sat down, defeated by her doubts, until she started hearing them. Faint cheers from an invisible crowd surrounded her

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

Example Scored Proficient–2 (Pf)

ears. Then she could see them subtly, her family, Hasim, her father in the hospital. Overwhelmed her eyes welled up as she began weeping of the floor of the ring she was trapped in. She finally had the courage to stand up and leave.

The day was finally here, the fight she had been training for, the sun blazing as it created a formation of sweat on Pia, although had no more worries. Both opponents step foot on the ring and the match began. Punches were thrown around like bullets hitting each girl by the vitals. Pia swung her fists vigorously as the crowd burst out chants of excitement. By the halfway point both women were bloodied. As the second bell rang the onslaught continued, until finally BANG. One punch decided it all. Pia fell on the cold and wet ground stained by sweat and blood, her large frame dropped while the roar of the people in her ears became faint, and then pitch black darkness. Pia had lost the match, her first one since she started boxing. She didn't care however, as she never lost herself.

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT–2

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Ideas and Impressions (Pf)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The student’s exploration of the topic is purposeful. • Perceptions and/or ideas are thoughtful and considered. • Support is specific and strengthens the student’s ideas and impressions. 	<p>On the <i>Planning</i> page, the student purposefully establishes that Pia’s “dreams are to become someone her family can rely on” (2) but that the burden of “being number one has left her doubtful and isolated” (2), causing her to develop “a fear for the ring” (2). However, by fighting, “She tries to overcome her fear” (2) and wins the “mental battle” (2) by preserving her sense of self.</p> <p>The student purposefully highlights Pia’s humble beginnings in “her family had little to their names” (3) and specifically supports their hardship in “it was vexing to get enough to eat” (3) and “her father could no longer work” (3). The student thoughtfully casts Pia as an answer to the family’s financial woes in “She started off in underground street fights so that she could provide money for her family” (3). When Pia meets Hasim, he sees “her potential of becoming one of the greatest fighters in India” (3). The notion of her athletic prowess is strengthened in “her reputation grew” (4) and “her career as a boxer had taken off and she had beaten numerous opponents” (4). Despite her “winning streak” (4), Pia is plagued by “the overwhelming pressures of being number one” (4), particularly when she is “scheduled to fight against one of the leading boxers in India” (4). The student strengthens this idea through the specific support of Pia’s relentless preparation in “She trained for days, never sleeping” (4) and in her subsequent dream of being “trapped within the confines” (4) of a boxing ring with “no escape” (4). The student purposefully explores Pia’s subliminal entrapment in “She finally sat down, defeated by her doubts” (4) until she hears “Faint cheers from an invisible crowd” (4) and sees “her family, Hasim, her father” (5). In recognizing the support and significance of her loved ones, she finds “the courage to stand up and leave” (5) her imagined prison.</p> <p>The student concludes with the considered perception that despite losing the match, “She didn’t care however, as she never lost herself” (5), demonstrating that in Pia’s physical loss, she has ironically achieved a psychological win because she conquers her self-doubt.</p>

Pf

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT–2

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Presentation (Pf)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The voice created by the student is distinct. • Stylistic choices are specific and the student’s creation of tone is competent. • The unifying and/or aesthetic effect is capably developed. <p align="center">Pf</p>	<p>The student creates a distinct voice in the recollection of an athlete bound by the pressures of her rising success and subsequent insecurities. The voice is distinct in “as she grew and grew to a towering height so did her competitive spirit” (3) and “This stress she felt inside of her swelled like a balloon” (4).</p> <p>The student creates a competent tone through the reflection of Pia’s journey. Initially, she is confident and passionate. Stylistic choices are specific in “The rigorous and testosterone filled atmosphere never fazed her as she stomped every single one of her opponents like they were ants on the burning Indian pavement” (3). The tone shifts to unease while Pia experiences anxiety over the fight as “She trained for days, never sleeping” (4) and “Hasim worried about her deterioration” (4). The tone finally moves to acceptance after her loss in “She didn’t care however, as she never lost herself” (5).</p> <p>The unifying effect is capably developed, beginning in medias res, where Pia falls unconscious as she loses the match, then tracing her origins as a fighter, and concluding by returning to the initial match. The response also employs a capable aesthetic effect in the motifs of light and darkness to achieve pathetic fallacy. To begin, Pia’s “vision began to darken” (3) as she is knocked to the ground. The student continues to use light imagery to describe the early stages of Pia’s development as an athlete in “The moon was waxing” (3), serving as an illumination of the setting as well as the dawn of her passion. Later in her training, Hasim “found a light within Pia” (3). Then she dreams of being imprisoned in a boxing ring, “darkness surrounding her with no light to be seen” (4). As she gains courage, the darkness is mitigated because “she could see them subtly” (5). She arrives for her fight, “the sun blazing” (5), because she is free of worry. The response concludes by returning the reader to the initial darkness of Pia’s knockout, reinforcing a capably developed unifying and aesthetic effect.</p>

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent–1 (E)

Initial Planning

To which of the provided texts are you responding? What is the connection between the text(s) and your response?

The photo taken by Tamara Gudzenko
as it works well with my own disability
commitments.

What idea about the prompting text(s) do you intend to explore and how does it address the topic?

The usage of my personal doubts
being my opponent, who I am trying to
defeat. Similar to the girl in the boxing
ring.

State your choice of prose form. Choose from prose forms that you have practised in English Language Arts 30–1. You may respond using a personal, creative, or analytical perspective. Do NOT use a poetic form.

personal prose

English Language Arts 30-1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent-1 (E)

"The tension between an individual's doubts and convictions"

Assignment I: Personal Response to Texts

Planning

Me
lawyer wife/mother safety
not
doubt: Can I actually do it? is that right
convictions: this is what I'm meant to do, what I want to do
connection: too level, opinionated
anti dependency → culture: less independence expectations "should I give up?"
tension: self-sabotage not studying procrastination
wanting to be independent does not mean wanting to be alone.
train, dodge, throwing a match

"take a hit"

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent–1 (E)

Limitless

Womanhood. They say I've reached it, but I am not sure I will ever know what that means. To be a woman, that is. I've toyed with the idea in my head for quite a while, trying to discern the meaning behind the word. When you're a five year old girl, it is easy. You wear dresses, and you like the colour pink. You stand in solidarity with the other five year old girls in your kindergarten class, and hate the boys. You play pretend, with the girls. You sit at tables, with the girls. The concept is so understandable that even the boys have their own version, only they pick the colour blue. When you're a five year old girl, you don't expect life to become so complex; you've adapted to living in a pink and blue world that you don't expect there to be any other colours. You don't expect to wake up one day, and realize the beliefs you were taught as a child have lost their validity. You don't expect to be thrust into a multicolour world, with no training or mechanisms to prepare you.

My parents were different. "You can do anything," was a line they fed me for as long as I can remember. They would brag about my intelligence and aptitude for school-sending pictures of my straight A report cards to their siblings, my uncles and aunts. My family would bless me, thanking God for the brain he had given me, and all I could do was blush, burying my head into the crook of my mother's arm. I didn't understand the weight of their words, and I also didn't understand the significance. I was happy to have made my parents proud, and to receive a hardcover copy of *The Mark of Athena*, a reward for my accomplishment. I was winning every match in this game of life, my parent's champion, and there were no limits to my capabilities. The older I became, the intensity of my school work increased. My opponents weren't taking it

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent–1 (E)

easy on me anymore; I was an eight grader taking high school level chemistry, learning the different grammatical tenses of intermediate Latin, and writing essays on William Shakespeare’s *Macbeth*. My parents held me in such high regard that I didn’t want to disappoint them. I would memorise every word of my textbooks, even if it meant staying up till midnight, and pass my tests with flying colours. I was undefeated, but I respected the process. The late nights, the hours spent making notes, and the hundreds of questions asked in class could not be forgotten-it was all apart of my training, the same way any athlete would prepare for a match.

“You want to be a what?” my mother asked, incredulously. “A lawyer,” I repeated, unsure of why she was shocked. I finally had a goal, a trophy I wanted to win to make all the practise worth it. What was she so surprised about? She looked at me gently, putting down the pot she had scrubbed to a silver gleam, and asked “How will you take care of your family if you are a lawyer?”

I was at a loss for words, and she took my silence as permission to continue. Hit after hit, she peppered me with question after question about a family I had not thought about, or more accurately, forgotten about. I absorbed all the blows, and, in a daze, returned to my room-unsure of what had just happened. “Remember,” my mother’s warning echoing in my head, “you are still a girl.” I woke up one morning to a list of chores that needed to be done, leaving me less time to study. I was losing matches to baskets of laundry that towered over me, and my training now consisted of learning how to chop onions. “This is what is feminine,” my aunts reinforced, “this is your duty, this is how you will support a family.” There was no more aimlessly waltzing the house anymore, instead, I would hide in my room, hoping and praying no one would call me for help.

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent–1 (E)

When you don't practise, you lose your skills. I still wanted to pursue law, but the doubt of what I could do and achieve was an opponent that was beating me. I started studying for tests the night before, and would lose matches that I knew I could have won. I would over season food, and burn toast. I couldn't get my head in the game, because I was too worried about my future. My self-sabotage was the only outcome I knew I could control, but I was simultaneously reinforcing doubts I had about my own intelligence and capabilities in the process. I felt so sure about going to law school, this was something I was meant to do. But my mom's information had hit me hard; I wanted a family, but why couldn't I have a career too? I hadn't expected my aspirations and ambitions to come second to a husband and children I didn't possess yet, and I hadn't expected to have to think about them so soon. Loss after loss, I felt defeated. I had forgotten what it was like to be a winner, I wasn't sure if that was still the same girl.

Making a comeback is never as easy as it looks, and my comeback is no different. My perspective of the world, I came to understand, was different than that of my parents. Growing up in Canada had given me opportunity that, perhaps, my mother did not have growing up in Ethiopia, in a pink and blue world that rarely reached other colours on the spectrum. I conquered my battle with cultural convictions the same way I conquered my academic struggles: with knowledge, reading, and a little bit of logic. I realized that wanting to be independent, and having my own career was not synonymous with wanting to be alone, or skirting housework. As hard as it can be, losing your matches can give you the time you need to learn new techniques, and strengthen your character. If you don't believe in yourself, you've already lost the match. I've realized that there is no exact definition of what it means to be a woman, the options are

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

Example Scored Excellent–1 (E)

limitless. My parents were right, I can do anything. I am back in the game, ready to defend my championship.

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT–1

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Ideas and Impressions (E)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The student’s exploration of the topic is insightful. • Perceptions and/or ideas are confident and discerning. • Support is precise and aptly reinforces the student’s ideas and impressions. <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold; margin-top: 20px;">E</p>	<p>On the <i>Initial Planning</i> page, the student introduces the discerning idea that her “personal doubts” (1) act as the “opponent” (1) that she is “trying to defeat” (1), demonstrating confident perceptions on the paradoxical nature of her “own doubts and convictions” (1).</p> <p>The response begins with the insightful exploration of the student’s understanding of “Womanhood” (3) and the doubt that she “will ever know what that means” (3). This doubt contrasts the student’s childhood conviction that she was simply expected to “stand in solidarity with the other five year old girls” (3). However, the student insightfully recognizes that, even in her youth, tension between expected gender conventions contradicted the “different” (3) convictions of her parents, who taught her that she “‘can do anything’” (3), which led her to believe that “there were no limits to my capabilities” (3). The student then insightfully perceives the source of her own tension when her mother doubts the student’s ability to “‘take care of your family’” (4) while also being “‘a lawyer’” (4). This mounting doubt is precisely and aptly reinforced through the “family” (4) expectations that she had “forgotten about” (4): the “list of chores that needed to be done” (4) and the “baskets of laundry that towered over me” (4).</p> <p>The student continues the insightful exploration through the confident statement “My self-sabotage was the only outcome I knew I could control, but I was simultaneously reinforcing doubts I had about my own intelligence and capabilities in the process” (5). Through recognizing her own complicity in the tension between doubt and conviction, the student confidently recognizes that “My perspective of the world, I came to understand, was different than that of my parents” (5). While admitting that “Making a comeback is never as easy as it looks” (5), the student concludes this insightful exploration by acknowledging that “I conquered my battle with cultural convictions the same way I conquered my academic struggles: with knowledge, reading, and a little bit of logic” (5).</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT–1

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Presentation (E)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The voice created by the student is convincing. • Stylistic choices are precise and the student’s creation of tone is adept. • The unifying and/or aesthetic effect is skillfully developed. <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold; margin-top: 20px;">E</p>	<p>The voice created by the student is convincing from the opening paragraph. The reflective tone in “They say I’ve reached it, but I am not sure I will ever know what means” (3) is continued adeptly through the statement “You don’t expect to wake up one day, and realize the beliefs you were taught as a child have lost validity” (3). The stylistic choices in the opening paragraph are also precise, such as in the use of epistrophe in “You play pretend, with the girls” (3) and “You sit at tables, with the girls” (3), as well as in the use of anaphora in “You don’t expect” (3).</p> <p>Throughout the entire response, the student skillfully develops a unifying effect by utilizing the analogy of “training” (3) and competition from the visual. At the beginning, the student recognizes that her own “intelligence and aptitude” (3) made her “my parent’s champion” (3). The unifying effect of competition skillfully continues through the “Hit after hit” (4) of “my mother’s warning” (4), which forces the student to return to an introspective tone: “But my mom’s information had hit me hard; I wanted a family, but why couldn’t I have a career too?” (5).</p> <p>The extended metaphor is continued through the student’s comparison of her lost conviction and her “comeback” (5) and skillfully develops the unifying effect through the final recognition that “As hard as it can be, losing your matches can give you the time you need to learn new techniques, and strengthen your character” (5).</p>

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent–2 (E)

Initial Planning

To which of the provided texts are you responding? What is the connection between the text(s) and your response?

The untold protagonist I am writing from a third person perspective of how the girl deals with doubts.

What idea about the prompting text(s) do you intend to explore and how does it address the topic?

I plan to explore the idea of giving up due to doubts breaking away at ones confidence. Afterwards realization at how silly it is to get caught up in the what ifs before even trying

State your choice of prose form. Choose from prose forms that you have practised in English Language Arts 30–1. You may respond using a personal, creative, or analytical perspective. Do NOT use a poetic form.

Creative

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent–2 (E)

The nameless girl rolled her shoulders, cracking her neck a few times to alleviate the feeling of tension tugging at her muscles. She took a deep breath in and eyed the shredded boxing ring in front of her, then exhaled roughly, bouncing on her heels a few times. The girl had promised her coach earlier that night as he was packing up that she would go home early for once, but now the clock had passed midnight and her neck was slickened with sweat. She was exhausted both mentally and physically, but she needed to train harder. After all, who else could defend her title of being the five-time national female boxing champion? Certainly not any of the new intakes. The girl ran her calloused fingers along the tattered ropes lining the boxing ring. Each rip was another memory. Memories of the countless hours of gruesome training she had endured with her team, most of which had long given up on their dreams after realizing how painfully difficult it would be to chase them. A bead of sweat dribbled down her forehead to her chin and trickled down to her neck. The training room was undeniably hot. The air reeked with a putrid odor that she could only define as the smell of hard work and determination. The girl licked her chapped lips and hauled herself up into the ring. Immediately she was filled with a surge of nervousness. Ignoring the feeling, she started to go through the basic motions for her training. Bruised knuckles struck out into open air; her ragged breaths filled the silence accompanied by the sounds of her feet shuffling across the floor of the ring. The girl spun around and struck into nothingness as she trained for a win that was not yet confirmed. Her breaths became harsher and her movements became sloppy. But still she continued on. To an outsider she would have looked quite strange, almost as if she was fighting against nothing yet somehow still losing. The girl threw a kick into the air and growled at herself

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent–2 (E)

in annoyance. None of her movements were landing right. The nameless girl let out an aggravated scream and dropped to her knees. She tugged at her dark hair, pulling tufts of it out of her perfectly slicked back ponytail to frame her brown face. Her emotions began to attack her all at once, not leaving her any room to breathe. The girl inhaled sharply and scooted herself backwards into one of the corners of the ring. What if she were to fail? She would never be able to face her coach and teammates again. Maybe she just wasn't good enough anymore, maybe she had finally lost her talent. The girl drew her knees close and held her breath, hoping to stop the little beads of weakness from spilling over her cheeks. Her muscles ached from her pushing them too hard and her head throbbed with the possibilities of losing. No, this wasn't a possibility anymore, the girl was going to fail. Her legs slid away from her and her eyes began to leak. Hot tears traveled down her face, mixing with the sweat that coated her skin. Her body shook with fear as the realization sunk in that she was probably never going to win again. She decided that when she lost, she would have to quit the team and give up like her original teammates had. She put a hand to her lips to stifle the sounds trying to escape. Sunlight streamed through the windows now, the sun had risen. Soon her coach would arrive, and he would yell at her for being so careless. The girl couldn't bring herself to care anymore. After all, she would be disappointing him with her match anyway. She draped her left arm over one of the ropes, her muscles screamed at the feeling of the hard surface below them but she paid them no attention. The girl felt lost and unsure of herself again. Almost like she was a teenager once more, still trying to find her passions and place in the world. Only, she wished she was still as innocent as she was back then. At least when she was young the world wasn't so cold and unforgiving. The sound of an old door screeching filled the air along with heavy footsteps that

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent–2 (E)

could only belong to her coach. The footsteps grew closer but stopped shortly. A bag hit the ground and soon a large hand had clamped down on her tired arm. The girl wiped furiously at her tear stained face, hoping that maybe he would mistake the redness of her eyes for being tired. Her coach sighed sadly, as if he were afraid this would happen. The old man hoisted himself up into the ring and sat beside her silently. He placed his heavy hand on her shoulder like a weight that could help ground her again. The girl looked to her coach sadly, barely being able to contain another round of tears begging to fall. The old man's eyes were kind and graying with age, similar to his hair that had grown streaks of white and gray over the years. The girl felt her worries lessening as she regained her composure. What had she been thinking? letting this round of weakness break away at her confidence. The only way to win would be with hard work and dedication, not by crying and giving up. The girl took a deep breath in and exhaled smoothly. With practice, she could win. And she would.

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT–2

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Ideas and Impressions (E)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The student’s exploration of the topic is insightful. • Perceptions and/or ideas are confident and discerning. • Support is precise and aptly reinforces the student’s ideas and impressions. 	<p>Using the visual as a prompting text, the student insightfully explores the topic through the narrative of a young woman who is “exhausted both mentally and physically” (2), grappling with a moment of weakness in which she must confront the insidious nature of doubt and the resulting tension when it begins to cloud her ability to think rationally.</p> <p>The student begins the response with discerning perceptions about the topic by describing the “tension tugging at her muscles” (2). This tension soon becomes a “surge of nervousness” (2) that the “nameless girl” (2) tries to ignore, only to find that “Her emotions began to attack her all at once” (3). The student confidently navigates the protagonist’s anxiety as her thoughts become increasingly erratic. She convinces herself that she is “probably never going to win again” (3), that she is going to have to “quit the team and give up” (3), and that her coach will “yell at her for being so careless” (3). The protagonist eventually concludes that she cannot “bring herself to care anymore” (3). Not until the end of the narrative, when the protagonist’s coach enters the ring and places a “heavy hand on her shoulder like a weight that could help ground her” (4), does the protagonist feel her “worries lessening” (4). She regains “her composure” (4) and comes to the subtle yet discerning epiphany that she had let a “round of weakness break away at her confidence” (4) and that “The only way to win would be with hard work and dedication” (4).</p> <p>In focusing the narrative on a single night of crisis, the student employs precise support to aptly reinforce the protagonist’s deteriorating mental state and her ability to eventually gain clarity. Early on, the student establishes a motif of breathing when the protagonist “exhaled roughly” (2). As she begins to fray, her breaths become “ragged” (2) and “harsher” (2), and eventually she is left without “any room to breathe” (3). After regaining her composure, “The girl took a deep breath in and exhaled smoothly” (4), and the student confidently and aptly displays that the tension has been alleviated, the protagonist has conquered her doubts, and is able to move forward with conviction.</p>

E

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT–2

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Presentation (E)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The voice created by the student is convincing. • Stylistic choices are precise and the student’s creation of tone is adept. • The unifying and/or aesthetic effect is skillfully developed. <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold; margin-top: 20px;">E</p>	<p>While the student’s response has obviously been prompted by the image, the student creates a convincing voice by focusing less on the details of boxing and more on the internal struggles of a character in crisis. The student uses precise stylistic choices such as rhetorical questions in “who else could defend her title” (2), “What if she were to fail?” (3), and “What had she been thinking?” (4), as well as introspective statements such as “No, this wasn’t a possibility anymore, the girl was going to fail” (3) and “At least when she was young the world wasn’t so cold and unforgiving” (3) to reveal the narrator’s anxieties.</p> <p>While the student does provide precise details about the protagonist’s “calloused fingers” (2), “chapped lips” (2), and “Bruised knuckles” (2) earned through the extensive and exhaustive training, it is the extended insight developed by the protagonist’s internal monologue that adeptly creates a tone of anxiety and doubt. This is evidenced by statements such as “Maybe she just wasn’t good enough anymore, maybe she had finally lost her talent” (3) and “The girl felt lost and unsure of herself again” (3).</p> <p>By exploring the events of a single night as it becomes day, the student is at once able to evoke the light and dark imagery of the visual and skillfully develop a unifying and aesthetic effect. The student begins the narrative with the girl taking “a deep breath” (2) while eyeing “the shredded boxing ring in front her” (2), and recalling that she “had promised her coach earlier that night as he was packing up that she would go home early for once” (2). With the creation of this scene, the student establishes a motif carried throughout the narrative, symbolizes the protagonist’s fragile mental state, and introduces a mentor who is aware of the situation. When the coach returns to the gym the next morning “afraid this would happen” (4), the student skillfully unifies the narrative.</p>

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

Initial Planning

You may use this space for your initial planning. This information assists markers in identifying the text you have chosen to support your ideas. The markers who read your composition will be very familiar with the literary text you have chosen.

Literary Text and
Text Creator

"Glass roses" by Alden Nowlan

Note: Write the title of your chosen literary text on the back cover of this examination booklet.

Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text
Suggested time: 10 to 15 minutes

Briefly explore your reasons for selecting the literary text as support for your response. Markers will consider the information you provide here when considering the effectiveness of your supporting evidence.

Main character's connection^{of} what a man
is, expectations of his father
eventually conflict with main character's connections

English Language Arts 30-1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

- Lekia shows a different set of
convictions to Stephen other than what he used to be

- glass roses

- friendship of Lekia

- at the beginning he believes a man
should what his father expects it to be.

First body sentence: '

English Language Arts 30-1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

Thesis:

Throughout the story Stephen experiences with ~~the~~ his father's expectations, his friendship with Leta, and the glass roses the story suggests that with the help of another individual an individual's convictions will ~~prevail~~ over

The story suggests that ~~as~~ with the help of another individual the ~~expectations~~ of others will not change convictions of an individual will change despite ~~the~~ expectations of others.

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

The expectations of others is very powerful for an individual especially when those expectations come from family members. Many grow up wanting to please their parents or family members by following the expectations placed upon them. The story "Glass Roses," by Alden Nowlan is about a boy whose convictions are changed by another individual despite the expectations of the boy's father. Through the use of the Stephen's father's expectations, Stephen's friendship with Leka, and the glass roses, Stephen's convictions are changed and strengthened with the help of Leka when he understands that there is more to life than his father's expectations.

Stephen is a 15 yr old boy who is working for his father cutting down wood. He is clearly not built for this job. Having a willowy body compared to the other men who were heavily built as stated by the story ox like shoulders. The other men did not talk and only spoke when it was necessary. They mostly just slept, ate, and continued working it was a seemingly never ending cycle of monotonous labour. Stephen looked up to his father believing that he was the ultimate definition of a man. To him his convictions were steadfast. His father was the leader of the group of wood cutters, was well built, and never talked unless it was necessary. This is who Stephen wanted to be. When Stephen is assigned with the Leka both are the weakest members of the group. He acts very differently than the other men, he talks about far off places and is very affectionate to Stephen. With Stephen's father seeing this he eventually pulls aside Stephen and tells Stephen that should Leka continue acting like that, Stephen's father would beat him. This highlights his father's expectations on Stephen that Stephen should act more like him and that

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

he should not be influenced by someone who is very different from his father. This gives a clear message on Stephen's father's expectations for him.

Stephen is assigned with the Polack, he is wary of him as he does not exude the characteristics of his father. His mistrust for the Polack eventually subsides and the allure of the Polack's stories leads Stephen to question the life ahead of him. As time passed they get along and the Polack tells Stephen his real name, Leka. Leka would tell the stories of his time in Ukraine during ww2. he talks about the glass roses that shattered when the bombs dropped near his mother's home. After telling the story, Leka tells Stephen that the world is not built for glass roses. This gives Stephen the idea that he is a glass rose that does not fit in the world that he is in. This helps change his convictions about his father's expectations for him. The story further strengthened his new convictions because now he understands he does not belong in that world.

Stephen's friendship with Leka changes his convictions regarding his father's expectations. There was one instance where both Leka and Stephen were cutting down trees. Leka tells Stephen that the world will not end should he stop cutting down trees. This highlighted the fact that woodcutting should Stephen stop would not be the end of his existence and that there was more for him to do than just cutting wood. Later on in the story Leka is having a nightmare and it leaves Stephen with a choice to make whether to wake him up or not. Not waking him up could mean that his convictions for his father's expectations is still strong or if he wakes him up then that could mean the convictions he has for his father's expectations have changed. This instance was after the time that Stephen's father threatened to beat Leka should he continue doing what Stephen's father felt was wrong. Knowing he is not built for the world he is in and

(Page 5 of 6)

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

understanding that there is more to life than cutting down trees he wakes up Leka. This possibly meant that his new convictions regarding his father's expectations have strengthened and changed because of Leka.

The expectations of others is very powerful for an individual especially when those expectations come from family members. Many want to be able to achieve it. Many align their convictions to match with the expectations of family members. In conclusion Alden Nowlan's story the "Glass Roses," highlights Stephen's journey in realizing with the help of Leka realized that his convictions regarding his father's expectations needed to be changed after realizing there is more to life than the expectations of a family member. Alden Nowlan leaves the reader to understand that they can apply this to life by understanding that there is more to this world than expectations of others and that are convictions can change and be strengthened when one finds this out.

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—SATISFACTORY

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Thought and Understanding (S)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ideas are relevant and straightforward, demonstrating a generalized comprehension of the literary text(s) and the topic. • Literary interpretations are general but plausible. 	<p>In the introduction, the student offers the relevant premise that “The expectations of others is very powerful for an individual especially when those expectations come from family members” (4). This straightforward idea connects to “The Glass Roses” in that “Stephen’s convictions are changed and strengthened with the help of Leka when he understands that there is more to life than his father’s expectations” (4).</p> <p>In a discussion of Stephen’s situation, the student demonstrates a generalized comprehension of the text in “Stephen looked up to his father believing that he was the ultimate definition of a man” (4) and in “This is who Stephen wanted to be” (4). By establishing Leka as a character foil to Stephen’s father, the student offers the plausible idea that Stephen feels “he should not be influenced by someone who is very different from his father” (5). The student then presents the relevant idea that “the allure of the Polack’s stories leads Stephen to question the life ahead of him” (5). This notion leads to the plausible literary interpretation that Leka helps to change Stephen’s “convictions about his father’s expectations for him” (5) because “now he understands he does not belong in that world” (5).</p> <p>The student demonstrates a generalized comprehension of the text and topic by connecting Stephen’s new understanding to his waking of Leka. The student recognizes that Stephen’s action reveals that “his new convictions regarding his father’s expectations have strengthened and changed because of Leka” (6). The student straightforwardly concludes the response with the claim that “convictions can change and be strengthened” (6) “after realizing there is more to life than the expectations of a family member” (6).</p>

S

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—SATISFACTORY

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Supporting Evidence (S)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Support is general, adequate, and appropriately chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in an acceptable way but occasionally may lack persuasiveness. • A reasonable connection to the student’s ideas is suitably maintained. 	<p>In the first body paragraph, centred largely on Stephen’s difference from the other pulp cutters, the student offers general support appropriately chosen to reinforce the idea about the contrast between Stephen’s “willowy body” (4) and the other workers “who were heavily built” (4) with “ox like shoulders” (4). Stephen’s incompatibility with the other men is adequately if implicitly reinforced in “The other men did not talk and only spoke when it was necessary. They mostly just slept, ate, and continued working” (4).</p> <p>The student appropriately reinforces the idea of Leka as an opposite to the rest of the workers in “He acts very differently than the other men, he talks about far off places and is very affectionate to Stephen” (4). The student uses this difference to reinforce the father’s expectation that “Stephen should act more like him” (4) or else the father will resort to violence with Leka.</p> <p>In a discussion of symbolism, the student offers general but adequate support in the way Leka “talks about the glass roses that shattered when the bombs dropped near his mother’s home” (5) and “that the world is not built for glass roses” (5). These details are appropriately chosen to reinforce the student’s idea that Stephen sees the destroyed glass roses as emblematic of the dissonance between his nature and his environment in “he is a glass rose that does not fit in the world that he is in” (5).</p> <p>As Stephen tries to reconcile his father’s expectations with his newfound self-awareness, the student cites Leka’s nightmare and mentions that “it leaves Stephen with a choice to make” (5). The student reasonably connects Stephen’s choice to his understanding “that there is more to life than cutting down trees he wakes up Leka” (6).</p>

S

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—SATISFACTORY

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Form and Structure (S)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A straightforward arrangement of ideas and details provides direction for the discussion that is developed appropriately. • The unifying effect or controlling idea is generally presented and maintained; however, coherence may falter. <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold;">S</p>	<p>The unifying effect is generally presented through the student’s chronological discussion of the story’s events. In the introduction, the student begins an appropriately developed discussion of the topic by focusing on how an individual’s family-influenced “convictions are changed” (4) due to the power of another individual. The ideas following this claim are straightforwardly arranged as the student moves from how “Stephen looked up to his father believing that he was the ultimate definition of a man” (4) to Leka’s stories, which cause Stephen to realize that “he does not belong in that world” (5). This experience with Leka “strengthened and changed” (6) Stephen’s “convictions regarding his father’s expectations” (6).</p> <p>The student provides details that appropriately develop the discussion in terms of the ideas within each body paragraph. In the first body paragraph, the student focuses on the influence of Stephen’s father and the contrast between Stephen and the other workers. In the second body paragraph, the student explains the effect of Leka’s stories on Stephen to broaden his perspective. In the third body paragraph, the student examines the ultimate influence of Leka on Stephen, who resists his father’s commands and moves to help Leka. The student’s controlling idea concerning the diminishing influence of Stephen’s father is generally presented and maintained throughout the response.</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—SATISFACTORY

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Matters of Choice (S)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Diction is adequate. • Syntactic structures are straightforward, but attempts at complex structures may be awkward. • Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a conventional composition with an appropriate voice. <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold;">S</p>	<p>The student maintains an appropriate voice, as evident in “Many grow up wanting to please their parents or family members by following the expectations placed upon them” (4) and “This possibly meant that his new convictions regarding his father’s expectations have strengthened and changed because of Leka” (6). The student’s stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a conventional composition, as in “His father was the leader of the group of wood cutters, was well built, and never talked unless it was necessary” (4).</p> <p>The student’s diction is adequate, as in “steadfast” (4) and “never ending cycle of monotonous labour” (4). The student’s repetition of the topic words throughout the response and later in the conclusion, as in “expectations of family members” (6), is also evidence of adequate diction.</p> <p>Syntactic structures are straightforward, as in “Leka tells Stephen that the world will not end should he stop cutting down trees” (5), but attempts at complex structures may be awkward, such as “With Stephen’s father seeing this he eventually pulls aside Stephen and tells Stephen that should Leka continue acting like that, Stephen’s father would beat him” (4).</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—SATISFACTORY

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Matters of Correctness (S)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • This writing demonstrates control of the basics of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. • There may be occasional lapses in control and minor errors; however, the communication remains clear. <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold;">S</p>	<p>The student’s writing demonstrates control of the basics of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics, as in “The story ‘Glass Roses,’ by Alden Nowlan is about a boy whose convictions are changed by another individual despite the expectations of the boy’s father” (4) and “Stephen’s friendship with Leka changes his convictions regarding his father’s expectations” (5).</p> <p>The response has minor errors involving subject/verb agreement, as in “The expectations of others is very powerful” (4), the absence of commas, as in “When Stephen is assigned with the Leka both are the weakest members of the group” (4) and “woodcutting should Stephen stop would not be the end of his existence” (5), and in capitalization, as in “ww2. he talks” (5).</p> <p>Occasional lapses in control, such as “the other men who were heavily built as stated by the story ox like shoulders” (4), also occur; however, the communication remains clear.</p>

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

Initial Planning

You may use this space for your initial planning. This information assists markers in identifying the text you have chosen to support your ideas. The markers who read your composition will be very familiar with the literary text you have chosen.

Literary Text and
Text Creator

"The Wars" by Timothy Findley

Note: Write the title of your chosen literary text on the back cover of this examination booklet.

Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text
Suggested time: 10 to 15 minutes

Briefly explore your reasons for selecting the literary text as support for your response. Markers will consider the information you provide here when considering the effectiveness of your supporting evidence.

· Depending on the strength of an individual's convictions, they will either conform & change themselves in order to meet others' expectations, or do what is best for them according to their beliefs.

· The strength of Robert's convictions is challenged when he enlists in war. He experiences the pressure of what the war expects of him (which is to go against his compassionate values), but in the end, because his convictions are so strong, this test strengthens them further, & Robert is renewed (reborn).

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

In Timothy Findley's novel *The Wars*, Findley portrays the protagonist, Robert Ross, as a fragile individual who has chosen to separate himself from the familiarity of his past life, in exchange for a life that puts the strength of his convictions to the test. He is thrown into a world where he is expected by those around him to go against everything he believes is right, causing him to question the validity of his beliefs and values. However, because of Robert's truly compassionate, selfless nature, he is able to overcome this questioning of his beliefs, allowing his experience to strengthen them instead. In the end, he is able to make a final decision that not only solidifies the strength of his renewed moral values and beliefs, but also restores him as the person he truly is.

From the very beginning, Robert's compassionate, empathetic nature is evident in the relationship that he has formed with his sister Rowena. As he grew up, the moment he learned that Rowena was unable to walk, he decided to become her guardian, and "It was for her he learned to run." Robert has in a way taken over the role of "protector of the innocent." He gives his body to those who are unable to use their own, and he acts as a voice for those who do not have one themselves. This shows that Robert values life to a great extent, seeing beauty in other living things, and which is why he gives a part of himself to help protect those who can not protect themselves. However, there is also a part of Robert that is naive and unsure. There are many aspects of life that Robert has

(Page 2 of 6)

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

yet to experience because of how sheltered he has been his entire life, which means that he has been unable to decide what he truly thinks of them. The first glimpse of Robert before he enlists is while the troops are marching down Yonge street. Robert's expression shows his confusion about what he sees, as part of him "doubts the validity" of it, but the other part of his brain stammers. It becomes clear that Robert does know what he believes in, but there is a lot that he has to learn in order to fully develop them.

Rowena's death is sudden, and Robert feels a great amount of guilt because he believes that he should have been watching her. Robert's mother decides that he should kill her rabbits, but he refuses. To Robert, Rowena's rabbits were an important aspect of her life, they survive her, and although he knows that she is no longer with them physically, he still wants to keep her memory alive, reinforcing once again the way Robert cherishes all life. When Teddy Budge and the soldier arrive to kill Rowena's rabbits instead, he asks them, "What are soldiers for?" Robert believes that a soldier's job is to protect and fight for innocent lives in the war, to prevent any more innocent lives from being lost, but now there is a soldier doing the exact opposite by assisting in killing these rabbits, and Robert questions it. Although Robert does leave for war in order to escape his guilt over Rowena's death, there is also a part of him that wants to find other innocent lives to protect.

By escaping to war, the moral values and beliefs that Robert has will be questioned by those around him, and he will suffer from external blows, as well as blows to his mind and the strength of his convictions. The first significant

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

moment where Robert truly questions the strength of his beliefs, takes place on the S.S. Massanabie when he is tasked with taking care of the horses in the hold. He descends down into the hold and is faced with a picture of war for what it is: filled with chaos and pain. Robert's descent into the hold is symbolic of man falling from his natural place of innocence, and to a place of dispassionate chaos that causes suffering. It is also symbolic of Robert's convictions being put to the test, as he steps away from his past, and moves towards a place where he is expected to go against what he believes in. When Robert is tasked with killing a horse who has broken its leg, he does not have a choice. His brain stammers. As the horse is killed, Robert feels as though a chair falls over in his mind, and the guilt from Rowena's death comes flooding back. The experience is traumatizing for Robert. It becomes evident that not only will Robert have to face a physical war, he will have to face the internal war of his beliefs being threatened. When an individual fights a war, they are expected to be dispassionate, because that is what war is. Robert's second experience with the German soldier had him struggling not only for his life, he also struggled with the person he has been forced to become because of the war. The German soldier shows an act of benevolence towards Robert and his men as he lets them go. However, when Robert mistakes the soldier's movement for reaching towards his gun, he shoots him. In this moment, Robert has become a murderer, and begins to question himself. He did what people in the war would have expected him to do, but the moment would haunt Robert for the rest of his life. Robert's third experience that has him questioning what he believes in, happens at Desole

(Page 4 of 6)

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

when he is assaulted by his fellow soldiers. He feels betrayal, as he believed that that these were people he could trust. At this moment, Robert's brain goes silent, as it seems that he can no longer handle the threats to the beliefs that he once lived his life by. The person he once was, has seemed to disappear, evident as Robert states that he feels "as though he'd left his face behind in a mirror and the Webley in a stranger's hand." The hope that he had in humanity has betrayed him, and he expresses this betrayal by burning Rowena's picture. He says that "This is not an act of anger – but an act of charity," showing the true extent of how war has damaged him, as he no longer believes that memories of someone as pure and innocent as Rowena belongs in a world so cruel.

Robert's ultimate decision to desert his post, free the horses, and his burning, stems from his experiences in war, and the blows that were thrown at him both physically and mentally. By enlisting in the war, Robert was faced with the expectations of others forced upon him, and these expectations threatened his mind and being, which ultimately allowed him to come out and find who he really was. Robert's compassionate beliefs, his commitment to life in the face of war where he could only see death, became strengthened further from his experience. Before going to war, there were aspects of human nature that Robert had never faced, so his beliefs could never fully develop, and now they had. Robert was able to overcome the expectations that war imposed on him, and ultimately solidify the strength of his convictions. Proof that Robert is now a fully compassionate individual reborn from his experience is when he tells Marian Turner "Not Yet." Robert has suffered many hard blows to his body and mind,

(Page 5 of 6)

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

and surrounded by the insanity of war, any other individual might have chosen to end their life right then. Robert however, cherishes life too much to end his own. He understands how important life and hope is, and how many innocent lives have been lost in a war that they did not have a say in, and he chose to live in favor of these innocent lives that did not get to choose. This goes in hand with when Robert said “It gives the war some meaning to know that the men who took your fire (and returned it) wore blue scarves or had grey mittens like your own’s.” Robert’s belief in humanity and life has been renewed, and he acknowledges that the men fighting in the war are innocent beings forced into terrible circumstances. Robert’s physical and mental wounds from his experiences with the elements of war ultimately renewed him, and he is now one with all of the elements, stronger than any one of them alone.

Timothy Findley’s novel *The Wars* shows that when an individual with strong beliefs is faced with expectations that threaten these convictions, their experience may strengthen their sense of self, and allow them to realize the person that they truly are.

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Thought and Understanding (Pf)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ideas are thoughtful and considered, demonstrating a competent comprehension of the literary text(s) and the topic. • Literary interpretations are revealing and sensible. <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold;">Pf</p>	<p>The student presents the thoughtful and considered idea that Robert “puts the strength of his convictions to the test” (2) by choosing to go to war, “where he is expected by those around him to go against everything he believes is right” (2). His experience in the war causes Robert to “question the validity of his beliefs and values” (2), but ultimately his conviction, as represented by his “truly compassionate, selfless nature” (2), is reinforced through “his renewed moral values and beliefs” (2). The student’s argument that Robert’s conviction is to maintain his “compassionate beliefs” (5) and to avoid succumbing to the expectation that soldiers “be dispassionate, because that is what war is” (4) illustrates a competent comprehension of the text and the topic.</p> <p>Robert’s conviction to “protect those who can not protect themselves” (2) is consistent with his initially naive belief that “a soldiers job is to protect and fight for innocent lives in the war” (3), an example of the student’s sensible interpretation of the text and topic. Robert’s conviction is tested by his experiences as a soldier, which result in “the internal war of his beliefs being threatened” (4). After examining how Robert feels that “The hope that he had in humanity has betrayed him” (5), the student closes the argument with the revealing literary interpretation that by the end of the novel, “Robert’s belief in humanity and life has been renewed, and he acknowledges that the men fighting in the war are innocent beings forced into terrible circumstances” (6).</p> <p>The student’s concluding statement that “when an individual with strong beliefs is faced with expectations that threaten these convictions, their experience may strengthen their sense of self” (6) captures the thoughtful and considered understanding of the text relative to the topic.</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Supporting Evidence (Pf)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Support is specific and well chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in a persuasive way. • A sound connection to the student’s ideas is capably maintained. <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold;">Pf</p>	<p>The student’s support for establishing Robert’s conviction to maintain his essentially compassionate nature is well chosen. For example, the student identifies that “the moment he learned that Rowena was unable to walk, he decided to become her guardian, and ‘It was for her he learned to run’” (2). As well, the student observes that Robert’s objection to killing Rowena’s rabbits is “reinforcing once again the way Robert cherishes all life” (3). Similarly, the student employs the specific detail of when Robert “descends down into the hold” (4) of the S.S. Massanabie to reinforce in a persuasive way the idea that this descent “is symbolic of man falling from his natural place of innocence, and to a place of dispassionate chaos” (4).</p> <p>Support is specific. After emphasizing the devastating impact of the assault at Desolé, the student notes that “The person he once was, has seemed to disappear” (5), leading to Robert’s decision to burn Rowena’s picture as “‘an act of charity’” (5). The student also connects the idea that Robert finally “chose to live in favor of these innocent lives that did not get to choose” (6) to the specific detail of “‘the men who took your fire (and returned it) wore blue scarves or had grey mittens like your owns’” (6).</p> <p>A sound connection between supporting details and the student’s ideas about the topic is evident in linking Robert’s killing of the German sniper with the perception that, in doing so, Robert “did what people in the war would have expected him to do, but the moment would haunt Robert for the rest of his life” (4). This link between support and ideas is also capably maintained in the statement “Proof that Robert is now a fully compassionate individual reborn from his experience is when he tells Marian Turner ‘Not Yet’” (5).</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Form and Structure (Pf)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A purposeful arrangement of ideas and details contributes to a controlled discussion that is developed capably. • The unifying effect or controlling idea is coherently presented and sustained. <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold;">Pf</p>	<p>The controlling idea is coherently presented on the <i>Initial Planning</i> page: “The strength of Robert’s convictions is challenged when he enlists in war. He experiences the pressure of what the war expects of him (which is to go against his compassionate values), but in the end, because his convictions are so strong, this test strengthens them further, & Robert is renewed (reborn)” (1). This controlling idea is sustained throughout the response. The student’s exploration of how “Robert’s compassionate, empathetic nature” (2) is incompatible with the senseless expectations that arise from “the insanity of war” (6) provides a purposeful arrangement of ideas and details.</p> <p>The student initially establishes Robert’s convictions in “Robert values life to a great extent” (2) and then moves the discussion to examine Robert’s reactions to both “Rowena’s death” (3) and “his experiences in war” (5), exploring how “expectations threatened his mind and being” (5). The student develops a controlled discussion of Robert, whose “commitment to life in the face of war where he could only see death, became strengthened further from his experience” (5). This controlled discussion is reinforced in the student’s assertion that “there were aspects of human nature that Robert had never faced, so his beliefs could never fully develop, and now they had” (5), and culminates with Robert being “one with all of the elements, stronger than any one of them alone” (6). The student coherently presents the controlling idea that “Robert’s belief in humanity and life has been renewed” (6) and develops capably a controlled discussion about Robert’s moral and physical journey through the test of war.</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Matters of Choice (Pf)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Diction is specific. • Syntactic structures are generally effective. • Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a considered composition with a capable voice. <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold;">Pf</p>	<p>The student’s diction is specific, as in “naive and unsure” (2), “a place of dispassionate chaos that causes suffering” (4), and “ultimately solidify the strength of his convictions” (5).</p> <p>Syntactic structures are generally effective: “He gives his body to those who are unable to use their own, and he acts as a voice for those who do not have one themselves” (2) and “It becomes evident that not only will Robert have to face a physical war, he will have to face the internal war of his beliefs being threatened” (4).</p> <p>Stylistic choices throughout the response, such as “He understands how important life and hope is, and how many innocent lives have been lost in a war that they did not have a say in” (6), contribute to the creation of a considered composition. The use of sentence variety, as in “To Robert, Rowena’s rabbits were an important aspect of her life, they survive her, and although he knows that she is no longer with them physically, he still wants to keep her memory alive, reinforcing once again the way Robert cherishes all life” (3) and “As the horse is killed, Robert feels as though a chair falls over in his mind, and the guilt from Rowena’s death comes flooding back” (4), and parallel structure, as in “Robert’s second experience with the German soldier had him struggling not only for his life, he also struggled with the person he has been forced to become because of the war” (4), contribute to the creation of a capable voice.</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Matters of Correctness (Pf)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • This writing demonstrates competent control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. • Minor errors in complex language structures are understandable considering the circumstances. <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold;">Pf</p>	<p>The student demonstrates competent control of correct sentence construction: “By escaping to war, the moral values and beliefs that Robert has will be questioned by those around him, and he will suffer from external blows, as well as blows to his mind and the strength of his convictions” (3) and “He descends down into the hold and is faced with a picture of war for what it is: filled with chaos and pain” (4).</p> <p>Minor errors in complex language structures, as in “It becomes clear that Robert does know what he believes in, but there is a lot that he has to learn in order to fully develop them” (3), “Robert’s ultimate decision to desert his post, free the horses, and his burning, stems from his experiences in war, and the blows that were thrown at him both physically and mentally” (5), and “Robert however, cherishes life to much to end his own” (6) are understandable considering the circumstances.</p>

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent (E)

Initial Planning

You may use this space for your initial planning. This information assists markers in identifying the text you have chosen to support your ideas. The markers who read your composition will be very familiar with the literary text you have chosen.

Literary Text and
Text Creator

The Great Gatsby
F. Scott Fitzgerald

Note: Write the title of your chosen literary text on the back cover of this examination booklet.

Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text
Suggested time: 10 to 15 minutes

Briefly explore your reasons for selecting the literary text as support for your response. Markers will consider the information you provide here when considering the effectiveness of your supporting evidence.

English Language Arts 30-1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent (E)

When an individual strives to bolster ^{relationship} their current lifestyle, they will attempt to re-create themselves in order to be successful. Ultimately, their own unquestionable dedication to the false persona they have erected will gradually cause the individual to drown in the vast repercussions of their lie.

BPI: 1.) Gatsby hates his past.

"all dead actually unsuccessful former"

2.) Seeing Dan Cody provides a template for the fantasy character he wishes to be, but is left with just the character, not the money/power/possessions, tangible markers of success.

3.) Meets Daisy, she is used to a certain lifestyle, he will create that life because he wants her: "more valuable in my eyes."

BPI: 1.) Meets Wolfshiem, gangster ^{who} provides fortune, by turning to the illegal activity, he begins to show a "by any means necessary attitude, ^{and finally} order to" in his decision to become his character!

2.) Re-meets Daisy through Nick: "Never loved him" she used to understand

3.) Tom uses Gatsby's past convictions as ammunition: "common bootlegger" ↳ sets him off.

"understand"
↓
like he
was he because

English Language Arts 30-1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent (E)

PPS: ~~loses~~ Daisy; so convinced he is who she wants that he takes the fall for her killing Myrtle Wilson: "Yes ... but of course I'll say I was."

2.) Stays embedded in that decision in his choice to play "the gentleman": Mr. Wilson comes and kills him as he's vulnerable. ~~But~~ Nick believes that Gatsby thought he would never die, and if he did, Nick did not think he would care.

3.) Dad comes back for wake, Final irony, Gatsby so convinced of the outcome of being his new person that he is shamed from the only thing that ever ~~had~~ had: The worn photo in Mr. Gatz's pocket that he showed Nick, expecting praise from him.

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent (E)

Fallacious Guys, Lies and Broken Lives

When an individual is drowning, they do not simply resign themselves to their fate, they grasp for anything that could possibly keep their head above the water. Whether it is a life preserver in the literal case of drowning, or the notions of success whispered by a gangster that promises wealth and prosperity instead of a life of poverty, the individual's body will feel forced to take it. In F. Scott Fitzgerald's *The Great Gatsby*, Nick Carroway narrates his experiences with a man by the name of Jay Gatsby. Gatsby grew up as an exceedingly poor boy, and despised his family roots because of it. When he was old enough to leave, he decided to change his name and become a new person, unintentionally becoming enamored in a lie constructed to gain the wealth that a girl used to a comfortable life would expect, specifically a girl named Daisy. Gatsby achieves his aspirations, but unintentionally leaves himself exposed to the detrimental repercussions of his decisions. When an individual strives to bolster their current lifestyle, they will attempt to re-create themselves in order to be successful. Ultimately, their own unquestionable dedication to the false persona they have erected, will gradually cause them to drown in the vast repercussions of their lies.

Jay Gatsby is so well known throughout New York that he becomes an almost mythical figure in the eyes of the public. However, this is not far from the truth as the man "Jay Gatsby" is simply a persona created by James Gatz, an impoverished seventeen year-old boy. When Gatsby takes Nick for lunch one afternoon he makes it clear that his parents are "all dead", but then later reveals that they are actually just "unsuccessful farmers" who live elsewhere. By allowing the public believe his parents were dead, rather than accept his poverty-stricken roots, this choice speaks to the extreme level of disgust he has for his heritage. By describing his parents as dead, Gatsby illustrates both the figurative nature of their death to him in that he is

(Page 4 of 8)

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent (E)

introducing the core catalyst for his meteoric rise: the thirst for the wealth and position he was deprived of as a child, and no longer acknowledges. After he left his parents and travelled around hoping to make a name for himself, he has the fortuitous opportunity to save an exceedingly wealthy man's life, Dan Cody. They sailed together for years, during which time Gatsby learned to play the role of a gentlemen, and when Dan Cody passed away he felt cheated that he did not inherit the vast wealth of his former mentor. The situation Gatsby finds himself in after the passing of one of the most impactful male role-models of his life, a man who provided him with the template for the fantasy character he desired to be; however, he was also left without the possessions and monetary values he viewed as being the markers of a successful man. Without Dan Cody to help guide his revitalization, Gatsby is left floating in the waters of a facade he has created with nothing to keep him from sinking under. While serving in the war, Gatsby encounters a beautiful girl named Daisy who comes from a very wealthy lifestyle; a lifestyle plagued by excess and exuberance. He tells Nick that the fact that so many men had fallen in love with her only "[increased] her value" in his eyes. This association of Daisy with a monetary value depicts the underlying fixation on the acquisition of power and prestige that drives Gatsby; he believes he has fallen for the girl, when in reality he has fallen for what he believes to be a prized trophy. However, Daisy is used to a rich lifestyle that Gatsby cannot provide, and as a result, his newfound lust for Daisy is the final nail in the coffin of his former life as "James Gatz", and the indefinite continuation of Jay Gatsby. After leaving his entire heritage behind, Gatsby is able to re-establish, and entrench himself in the new facade inspired by Dan Cody and the need to meet the expectations Daisy's lifestyle demands. With no apparent way of achieving the vast wealth he desires in order to fill the gentlemen personality inherited from Dan Cody, Gatsby is forced to become more desperate and turn a blind-eye to more dubious courses of action.

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent (E)

Gatsby comes home from the war with no money, one pair of clothes, and no way to keep his head above the waters of defeat until he stumbles into another serendipitous connection. Mr. Wolfshiem is a gangster who represents the mobster culture of the era, and when he meets Gatsby he is impressed by his gentlemanly demeanor. Wolfshiem later tells Nick that “he made [Gatsby]”, and that without him he would never have made his fortune. The conscious decision to turn to illegal actions in order to further his own agenda further illustrates the finality of Gatsby’s new character. He knows that he cannot simply back out once he has committed to a relationship with his shady associates, and as a result he commits to an endless loop of illegal activity because he believes he must gain the power and prestige Daisy requires. After making his copious amounts of wealth, Gatsby rekindles his relationship with Daisy through a meeting he orchestrated through Nick. Gatsby then invites Daisy, and her current husband Tom to one of his parties, and once they leave he tells Nick that she must tell Tom she “never loved him”, and then makes the comment how “she used to understand”. Gatsby has been dreaming, choked by his romanticised vision of the future, ever since he submerged himself into the personality of “Jay Gatsby”. He is convinced that everything will go his way, and everyone should do as he desires. His absolute faith in the future has blocked his view of the autonomy of others, and the morality of his actions. He continues to encourage Daisy to confront Tom, and one afternoon, while all three of them are present in a group in a city, the culmination of his efforts is realized. Very hesitantly, Daisy tries to tell Tom, and when Gatsby steps in to assist her, Tom calls him “common” and a “bootlegger” which throws Gatsby into an uncharacteristic rage. With his meticulously prepared image now shattered, he exposes his true self, the anger and disgust fostered from his upbringing, to Daisy, and as a result, allows her to be washed out of his life forever. Like a dam waiting to burst, the consequences of his immoral conduct have been building up since the genesis of his Jay Gatsby charade. Now, with Tom’s

(Page 6 of 8)

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent (E)

words as the final blow, the dam has burst, sweeping Gatsby off his feet, and leaving him floating helplessly in the murky waters of the repercussions.

Although he has lost his dream, Gatsby is so enamoured in the absolute nature of his future that he does not realize the facts of the reality around him. After Tom sends Daisy and Gatsby back home in the same car after their large dispute, Myrtle Wilson was struck and killed by the individual driving Gatsby's car. Once Gatsby arrives home, he hides in the bushes to keep watch over Daisy, and when Nick returns he asks Gatsby if Daisy was actually driving his car when Myrtle was killed, to which Gatsby replies, "yes... but of course I'll say it was me". This interaction demonstrates how, unbeknownst to himself, it is time to wake up from his fantasy dream. Although he has lost her, Gatsby is so convinced that he has lived up to Daisy's expectations, he has done absolutely everything right, and that because of this he takes the fall for her crime believing it will spark their love once again. Subsequently, the fact that he must "hide" while watching over Daisy is a clear queue that he is no longer what she is searching for, and will remain hidden forever. Regardless of the lack of acknowledgment from Daisy when Gatsby is publicly disgraced and convicted for the murder of Myrtle Wilson, he still chooses to remain as the "gentlemen". Nick is just leaving Gatsby's house as he wonders if Gatsby actually believes he is able to die, and if he believes he can, then maybe he simply does not care. The fact that Gatsby would not believe he can die illustrates even further his fall to the depths of the facade he himself has created. He has spent the majority of his life trying to be a person who can be revered, and can exceed the expectations of others, but has actually succumb to his own belying actions as a new-era god, leaving himself exposed. In his ignorance to the fact that someone would try and kill "Jay Gatsby", he allows himself to be shot and killed by Myrtle's husband. One of the only attendees at Gatsby's funeral is Mr. Gatz, his father, who proudly compares a worn photo of Gatsby's house with the real iteration for Nick, who is looked at

(Page 7 of 8)

English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent (E)

apprehensively by a Mr. Gatz searching for approval. In one of the final ironies of the play, the sole idea Gatsby has been distancing himself from his entire life is the only part of it that comes back in the end. The photo is worn which implies that Mr. Gatz had taken it out to show off his son's achievements many times, and as a result, further illustrates how Gatsby's conviction to a life ignorant of his past deprived him of a relationship with the only people whose expectations he would never need to meet: his parents. Gatsby had been consumed by the vast waves of adverse consequences that came with taking the criminal route to his illustrious way of life. Even though he should have been trying to swim out of the mess, he remained stagnant, stuck in his beliefs, and inevitably let himself continually spiral downward into the depths.

In an effort to find a way out of his poor situation, Gatsby reached for the closest thing to him that he believed would keep his head above the water, Mr. Wolfshiem and his criminal organization and connections. Unfortunately for Gatsby, instead of acting as the "life-preserver" he so desperately needed, he cemented himself into a way of life that would inevitably drag him to the bottom of the facade he had created in order to please Daisy, and drown. By choosing a new and glamorous life over his old one, and refusing to acknowledge where he truly came from, he lost one of the only things that could have properly filled the hole he felt was growing inside of him by. He chased after the approval of something he only wanted as a prize, and lost the ability to effectively weigh the morality of his actions, leading him to follow a darker path. Inevitably, he found himself in a worse situation than when he began: broke, publicly disgraced, and murdered. If the convictions, the foundation, associated with an individual's desires to excel do not take into account the past, then they will eventually succumb to a similarly substandard life where they continually swim deeper into the darkness even though they believe they are heading for the light.

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Thought and Understanding (E)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ideas are insightful and carefully considered, demonstrating a comprehension of subtle distinctions in the literary text(s) and the topic. • Literary interpretations are perceptive and illuminating. 	<p>On the <i>Planning</i> page, the student establishes the carefully considered idea that “When an individual strives to bolster their current lifestyle, they will attempt to re-create themselves in order to be successful” (2). The student identifies the root of Gatsby’s convictions in “Gatsby grew up as an exceedingly poor boy” (4), which leads to Gatsby “unintentionally becoming enamoured” (4) with the American Dream. The student then insightfully recognizes that, for Gatsby, convictions based on “wealth and prosperity” (4) constitute a thinly veiled attempt to meet the expectations of others, in particular Daisy, “a girl used to a comfortable life” (4).</p> <p>The student initiates this insightful idea through the perceptive and illuminating literary interpretation that Gatsby has become “an almost mythical figure” (4), although he is only “a persona created by James Gatz” (4). As well, the student recognizes the subtle distinction that Gatsby associates Daisy with “monetary value” (5), reinforcing his “underlying fixation on the acquisition of power and prestige” (5). The student presents the illuminating literary interpretation that Gatsby, obsessed with Daisy, makes a crucial error: “His absolute faith in the future has blocked his view of the autonomy of others, and the morality of his actions” (6).</p> <p>The students offers the carefully considered idea that Gatsby, fully committed to the ideal version of himself, turns “to illegal actions” (6) to achieve that ideal version. The student then perceptively discusses how Tom “shattered” (6) Gatsby’s “meticulously prepared image” (6) and the consequences of Gatsby’s inability to “realize the facts of the reality around him” (7). As a result, the student arrives at the insightful and carefully considered idea that “If the convictions, the foundation, associated with an individual’s desires to excel do not take into account the past, then they will eventually succumb to a similarly substandard life” (8).</p>

E

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p style="text-align: center;">E</p> <p>Supporting Evidence (E)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Support is precise and astutely chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in a convincing way. • A valid connection to the student’s ideas is efficiently maintained. 	<p>The student uses precise support for Gatsby’s elaborate efforts to sustain the “persona created by James Gatz” (4) by noting how “When Gatsby takes Nick for lunch one afternoon he makes it clear that his parents are ‘all dead’, but then later reveals that they are actually just ‘unsuccessful farmers’ who live elsewhere” (4). This event reinforces in a convincing way the student’s idea that “By allowing the public believe his parents were dead, rather than accept his poverty-stricken roots, this choice speaks to the extreme level of disgust he has for his heritage” (4).</p> <p>In assessing the influence of Dan Cody on Gatsby’s ambitions, the student employs the astutely chosen support that “Gatsby learned to play the role of a gentlemen” (5) and, more importantly, Cody “provided him with the template for the fantasy character he desired to be” (5). The student efficiently maintains a valid connection between the influence of Gatsby’s origins and Cody’s example and the idea that Gatsby’s ambition is as much an escape from the past as it is a pursuit of a wealthy future with Daisy: “his newfound lust for Daisy is the final nail in the coffin of his former life as ‘James Gatz’, and the indefinite continuation of Jay Gatsby” (5).</p> <p>The student’s precise development and synthesis of the support uses details from the novel in a convincing way to convey the moment when Gatsby’s quest falters: “Very hesitantly, Daisy tries to tell Tom, and when Gatsby steps in to assist her, Tom calls him ‘common’ and a ‘bootlegger’ which throws Gatsby into an uncharacteristic rage” (6).</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Form and Structure (E)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A judicious arrangement of ideas and details contributes to a fluent discussion that is developed skillfully. • The unifying effect or controlling idea is effectively presented and integrated. 	<p>On the <i>Planning</i> pages, the student presents an arrangement of ideas that revolves around the exploration of an individual’s convictions in the pursuit of success, as defined by the expectations of others. The student effectively presents a controlling idea focussed on a character’s “unquestionable dedication to the false persona they have erected” (2), which will “gradually cause the individual to drown in the vast repercussions of their lies” (2). On closer inspection, the appearance of a three-body-paragraph structure reveals multiple layers within their construction, resulting in a judicious arrangement of ideas, contributing to a fluent discussion that is developed skillfully.</p> <p>By establishing that Gatsby “decided to change his name and become a new person” (4), the student effectively integrates the controlling idea of the “persona” (4) through the “new facade inspired by Dan Cody” (5) to the “finality of Gatsby’s new character” (6). The student also effectively extends that controlling idea by exploring how “Gatsby would not believe he can die” (7) in order to illustrate “the depths of the facade he himself has created” (7).</p> <p>The student effectively presents and integrates a unifying effect by initially introducing the motif of drowning through metaphorical and literal water in “Whether it is a life preserver in the literal case of drowning, or the notions of success” (4). This unifying element effectively parallels the ebb and flow of James Gatz’s reliance on his persona as he is first buoyed by “floating in the waters of a facade” (5) before he fully “submerged himself” (6) in the role of Gatsby. As the consequences of Gatsby’s conviction become apparent, the student dramatizes the motif in recognizing that “the dam has burst” (7) as Gatsby deals with “the vast waves of adverse consequences” (8), which eventually forces him to “swim deeper into the darkness” (8).</p>

E

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Matters of Choice (E)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Diction is precise. • Syntactic structures are effective and sometimes polished. • Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a skillful composition with a convincing voice. <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold; margin-top: 20px;">E</p>	<p>Diction is precise throughout the response, as in “Gatsby achieves his aspirations, but unintentionally leaves himself exposed to the detrimental repercussions of his decisions” (4); “By describing his parents as dead, Gatsby illustrates both the figurative nature of their death to him in that he is introducing the core catalyst for his meteoric rise: the thirst for the wealth and position he was deprived of as a child” (4–5); “guide his revitalization” (5); “plagued by excess and exuberance” (5); and “serendipitous connection” (6).</p> <p>The student’s intentional attempts at varied syntactical structures are effective and sometimes polished, as in “In his ignorance to the fact that someone would try and kill ‘Jay Gatsby’, he allows himself to be shot and killed by Myrtle’s husband” (7). Additionally, the student effectively uses parenthetical and parallel structures, as in “Inevitably, he found himself in a worse situation than when he began: broke, publicly disgraced, and murdered” (8).</p> <p>The student demonstrates <i>effective stylistic choices to enhance communication</i> by skillfully employing precise diction. The student has constructed a metaphor relating to water in an attempt to create a convincing voice, as in “floating helplessly in the murky waters of the repercussions” (7). The skillful composition continues through the stylistic choice to integrate the water motif throughout the response, and this convincing voice concludes with the skillful summation of the image in “they continually swim deeper into the darkness even though they believe they are heading for the light” (8).</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, January 2020
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p>Matters of Correctness (E)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • This writing demonstrates confident control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. • The relative insignificance of error is impressive considering the complexity of the response and the circumstances. <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold;">E</p>	<p>The student demonstrates confident control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics: “However, Daisy is used to a rich lifestyle that Gatsby cannot provide, and as a result, his newfound lust for Daisy is the final nail in the coffin of his former life as ‘James Gatz’, and the indefinite continuation of Jay Gatsby” (5), as well as through the subordination and coordination of “Gatsby has been dreaming, choked by his romanticised vision of the future, ever since he submerged himself into the personality of ‘Jay Gatsby’” (6).</p> <p>The relative insignificance of error is impressive considering the complexity of the response and the circumstances: “The photo is worn which implies that Mr. Gatz had taken it out to show off his son’s achievements many times, and as a result, further illustrates how Gatsby’s conviction to a life ignorant of his past deprived him of a relationship with the only people whose expectations he would never need to meet: his parents” (8).</p>

Scoring Categories and Criteria

Scoring Categories and Scoring Criteria for 2019–2020 Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Because students' responses to the *Personal Response to Texts Assignment* vary widely—from philosophical discussions to personal narratives to creative approaches—assessment of the *Personal Response to Texts Assignment* on the diploma examination will be in the context of Louise Rosenblatt's suggestion:

... the evaluation of the answers would be in terms of the amount of evidence that the youngster has actually read something and thought about it, not a question of whether, necessarily, he has thought about it the way an adult would, or given an adult's "correct" answer.

Rosenblatt, Louise. "The Reader's Contribution in the Literary Experience: Interview with Louise Rosenblatt." By Lionel Wilson. *English Quarterly* 14, no.1 (Spring, 1981): 3–12.

Markers will also consider Grant P. Wiggins' suggestion that we should assess students' writing "with the tact of Socrates: tact to respect the student's ideas enough to enter them fully—even more fully than the thinker sometimes—and thus the tact to accept apt but unanticipatable or unique responses."

Wiggins, Grant P. *Assessing Student Performance: Exploring the Purpose and Limits of Testing*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers, 1993, p. 40.

Ideas and Impressions (10% of total examination mark)
Cross-reference to the Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts 2.1, 2.2, 2.3, 4.1

When marking **Ideas and Impressions**, the marker should consider

- the student's **exploration** of the topic in relation to the prompting text(s)
- the student's **ideas and reflection**
- **support** in relation to the student's ideas and impressions

Excellent

E

The student's exploration of the topic is insightful. Perceptions and/or ideas are confident and discerning. Support is precise and aptly reinforces the student's ideas and impressions.

Proficient

Pf

The student's exploration of the topic is purposeful. Perceptions and/or ideas are thoughtful and considered. Support is specific and strengthens the student's ideas and impressions.

Satisfactory

S

The student's exploration of the topic is generalized. Perceptions and/or ideas are straightforward and relevant. Support is adequate and clarifies the student's ideas and impressions.

Limited

L

The student's exploration of the topic is vague. Perceptions and/or ideas are superficial and/or ambiguous. Support is imprecise and/or ineffectively related to the student's ideas and impressions.

Poor

P

The student's exploration of the topic is minimal. Perceptions and/or ideas are undeveloped and/or irrelevant. Support is lacking and/or unrelated to the student's ideas and impressions.

Insufficient

INS

Insufficient is a special category. It is not an indicator of quality. Assign Insufficient when

- the student has responded using a form other than prose **OR**
- the student has written so little that it is not possible to assess Ideas and Impressions **OR**
- there is no evidence that the topic presented in the assignment has been addressed **OR**
- there is no connection between the text(s) provided in the assignment and the student's response **OR**
- there is no evidence of an attempt to fulfill the task presented in the assignment

Scoring Categories and Scoring Criteria for 2019–2020
Personal Response to Texts Assignment
(continued)

Presentation (10% of total examination mark)
Cross-reference to the Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts 3.1, 3.2, 4.1, 4.2

When marking **Presentation**, the marker should consider the effectiveness of

- **voice** in relation to the context created by the student in the chosen prose form
- **stylistic choices** (including quality and correctness of language and expression) and the student’s creation of **tone**
- the student’s development of a **unifying and/or aesthetic effect**

Consider the complexity of the response in terms of its context and length.

Excellent
E The voice created by the student is convincing. Stylistic choices are precise and the student’s creation of tone is adept. The unifying and/or aesthetic effect is skillfully developed.

Proficient
Pf The voice created by the student is distinct. Stylistic choices are specific and the student’s creation of tone is competent. The unifying and/or aesthetic effect is capably developed.

Satisfactory
S The voice created by the student is apparent. Stylistic choices are adequate and the student’s creation of tone is conventional. The unifying and/or aesthetic effect is appropriately developed.

Limited
L The voice created by the student is undiscerning and/or unsuitable. Stylistic choices are imprecise and the student’s creation of tone is inconsistent. The unifying and/or aesthetic effect is inadequately developed.

Poor
P The voice created by the student is confused. Stylistic choices impede communication and the student’s creation of tone is ineffective. A unifying and/or aesthetic effect is haphazard or obscure.

Scoring Categories and Scoring Criteria for 2019–2020 Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Because students’ responses to the *Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment* vary widely—from philosophical discussions to personal narratives to creative approaches—assessment of the *Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment* on the diploma examination will be in the context of Louise Rosenblatt’s suggestion: *... the evaluation of the answers would be in terms of the amount of evidence that the youngster has actually read something and thought about it, not a question of whether, necessarily, he has thought about it the way an adult would, or given an adult’s “correct” answer.*

Rosenblatt, Louise. “The Reader’s Contribution in the Literary Experience: Interview with Louise Rosenblatt.” By Lionel Wilson. *English Quarterly* 14, no.1 (Spring, 1981): 3–12.

Markers will also consider Grant P. Wiggins’ suggestion that we should assess students’ writing “with the tact of Socrates: tact to respect the student’s ideas enough to enter them fully—even more fully than the thinker sometimes—and thus the tact to accept apt but unanticipatable or unique responses.”

Wiggins, Grant P. *Assessing Student Performance: Exploring the Purpose and Limits of Testing*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers, 1993, p. 40.

Thought and Understanding (7.5% of total examination mark)
Cross-reference to the Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts 2.1, 2.2, 4.1, 4.2

When marking **Thought and Understanding**, the marker should consider

- how effectively the student’s **ideas** relate to the assignment
- the quality of the **literary interpretations** to show **understanding** of the text relative to the topic

Excellent

E

Ideas are insightful and carefully considered, demonstrating a comprehension of subtle distinctions in the literary text(s) and the topic. Literary interpretations are perceptive and illuminating.

Proficient

Pf

Ideas are thoughtful and considered, demonstrating a competent comprehension of the literary text(s) and the topic. Literary interpretations are revealing and sensible.

Satisfactory

S

Ideas are relevant and straightforward, demonstrating a generalized comprehension of the literary text(s) and the topic. Literary interpretations are general but plausible.

Limited

L

Ideas are superficial or oversimplified, demonstrating a weak comprehension of the literary text(s) and the topic. Literary interpretations are incomplete and/or literal.

Poor

P

Ideas are largely absent or irrelevant, and/or do not develop the topic. Little comprehension of the literary text(s) is demonstrated.

Insufficient

INS

Insufficient is a special category. It is not an indicator of quality. Assign Insufficient when

- the student has written so little that it is not possible to assess Thought and Understanding and/or Supporting Evidence **OR**
- no reference has been made to literature studied **OR**
- the only literary reference present is to the text(s) provided in the first assignment **OR**
- there is no evidence of an attempt to fulfill the task presented in the assignment

Scoring Categories and Scoring Criteria for 2019–2020 Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Supporting Evidence (7.5% of total examination mark)
Cross-reference to the Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts 2.3, 3.2, 4.1, 4.2

When marking **Supporting Evidence**, the marker should consider

- the **selection** and **quality** of evidence
- how well the supporting evidence is **employed**, **developed**, and **synthesized** to support the student’s ideas

Consider ideas presented in the *Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text(s)*.

Excellent
E Support is precise and astutely chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in a convincing way. A valid connection to the student’s ideas is efficiently maintained.

Proficient
Pf Support is specific and well chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in a persuasive way. A sound connection to the student’s ideas is capably maintained.

Satisfactory
S Support is general, adequate, and appropriately chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in an acceptable way but occasionally may lack persuasiveness. A reasonable connection to the student’s ideas is suitably maintained.

Limited
L Support is inadequate, inaccurate, largely a restatement of what was read, and/or inappropriately chosen in relation to the student’s ideas and thus lacks persuasiveness. A weak connection to the student’s ideas is maintained.

Poor
P Support is irrelevant, overgeneralized, lacks validity, and/or is absent. Little or no connection to the student’s ideas is evident.

*Scoring Categories and
Scoring Criteria for
2019–2020
Critical/Analytical
Response to Literary
Texts Assignment*

Form and Structure (5% of total examination mark)

Cross-reference to the Program of Studies for
Senior High School English Language Arts 2.2, 3.1, 4.1, 4.2

When marking **Form and Structure**, the marker should consider

- the manner in which the student **focuses, arranges, and shapes** the discussion in response to the assignment
- how well a **unifying effect** or a **controlling idea** is developed and maintained

Excellent

E

A judicious arrangement of ideas and details contributes to a fluent discussion that is developed skillfully. The unifying effect or controlling idea is effectively presented and integrated.

Proficient

Pf

A purposeful arrangement of ideas and details contributes to a controlled discussion that is developed capably. The unifying effect or controlling idea is coherently presented and sustained.

Satisfactory

S

A straightforward arrangement of ideas and details provides direction for the discussion that is developed appropriately. The unifying effect or controlling idea is generally presented and maintained; however, coherence may falter.

Limited

L

A discernible but ineffectual arrangement of ideas and details provides some direction for the discussion that is underdeveloped. A unifying effect or controlling idea is inconsistently maintained.

Poor

P

A haphazard arrangement of ideas and details provides little or no direction for the discussion, and development is lacking or obscure. A unifying effect or controlling idea is absent.

Scoring Categories and Scoring Criteria for 2019–2020 Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Matters of Choice (5% of total examination mark)

Cross-reference to the Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts 4.2

When marking **Matters of Choice**, the marker should consider how effectively the student’s choices enhance communication. The marker should consider

- **diction**
- choices of **syntactic structures** (such as parallelism, balance, inversion)
- the extent to which **stylistic choices** contribute to the creation of **voice**

Excellent

E

Diction is precise. Syntactic structures are effective and sometimes polished. Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a skillful composition with a convincing voice.

Proficient

Pf

Diction is specific. Syntactic structures are generally effective. Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a considered composition with a capable voice.

Satisfactory

S

Diction is adequate. Syntactic structures are straightforward, but attempts at complex structures may be awkward. Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a conventional composition with an appropriate voice.

Limited

L

Diction is imprecise and/or inappropriate. Syntactic structures are frequently awkward and/or ambiguous. Inadequate language choices contribute to the creation of a vague composition with an undiscerning voice.

Poor

P

Diction is overgeneralized and/or inaccurate. Syntactic structures are uncontrolled and/or unintelligible. A lack of language choices contributes to the creation of a confused composition with an obscure voice.

Scoring Categories and Scoring Criteria for 2019–2020 Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Matters of Correctness (5% of total examination mark)
Cross-reference to the Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts 4.2

When marking **Matters of Correctness**, the marker should consider the correctness of

- **sentence construction** (completeness, consistency, subordination, coordination, predication)
- **usage** (accurate use of words according to convention and meaning)
- **grammar** (subject-verb/pronoun-antecedent agreement, pronoun reference, consistency of tense)
- **mechanics** (punctuation, spelling, capitalization)

Consider the proportion of error in terms of the complexity and length of the response.

Excellent

E

This writing demonstrates confident control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. The relative insignificance of error is impressive considering the complexity of the response and the circumstances.

Proficient

Pf

This writing demonstrates competent control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. Minor errors in complex language structures are understandable considering the circumstances.

Satisfactory

S

This writing demonstrates control of the basics of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. There may be occasional lapses in control and minor errors; however, the communication remains clear.

Limited

L

This writing demonstrates faltering control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. The range of errors blurs the clarity of communication.

Poor

P

This writing demonstrates lack of control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. Jarring errors impair communication.